

GLOBAL VALUE CHAIN DEVELOPMENT REPORT 2017

MEASURING AND ANALYZING THE IMPACT OF GVCs ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT



GLOBAL VALUE CHAIN DEVELOPMENT REPORT 2017

MEASURING AND ANALYZING THE IMPACT OF GVCs ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT



© 2017 International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank

1818 H Street NW
Washington DC 20433
Telephone: 202-473-1000
Internet: www.worldbank.org

This work is a product of the World Bank Group, the Institute of Developing Economies, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, the Research Center of Global Value Chains headquartered at the University of International Business and Economics, and the World Trade Organization and is based on joint research efforts to better understand the ongoing development and evolution of global value chains and their implications for economic development. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this work are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the co-publishing partners, their Boards of Executive Directors, or the governments they represent.

The co-publishing partners do not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of the co-publishing partners concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Rights and Permissions

The material in this work is subject to copyright. Because the co-publishing partners encourage dissemination of their knowledge, this work may be reproduced, in whole or in part, for noncommercial purposes as long as full attribution to this work is given.

Any queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to World Bank Publications, The World Bank Group, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA; fax: 202-522-2625; e-mail: pubrights@worldbank.org.

ISBN 978-92-870-4125-8

This publication uses U.S. spelling. All mentions of dollars refer to U.S. dollars, unless otherwise indicated. The term “billion” refers to a thousand million.

The Research Center of Global Value Chains acknowledges the financial support from the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation.

Contents

Foreword by Michael Spence	iii
Foreword by Pol Antràs	v
Partners	xi
Contributors	xii
Acknowledgments	xiii
Abbreviations and acronyms	xiv
Executive summary	1
Chapter 1 Analytical frameworks for global value chains: An overview	15
The global value chain paradigm: New-New-New Trade Theory?	15
Concept development	17
Economic modeling	20
Empirical challenges	22
So, what’s next?	27
Meta-methodological considerations	28
Chapter 2 Recent trends in global trade and global value chains.	37
Intermediate trade in manufactured goods and global business cycles	38
Decomposing domestic value added and final goods production into global value chain and other activities	41
Global value chain production activities in the global business cycle	43
Measuring smile curves in global value chains: Creation and distribution of value added and job opportunities	52
Conclusions	60
Chapter 3 From domestic to regional to global: Factory Africa and Factory Latin America?.	69
What is upgrading?	69
Integration for growth: Imports for exports	72
Regional value chains as enablers of integration into global supply chains	74
National experience with value chain upgrading and integration: Automotive sector	81
Conclusions	89
Chapter 4 Accumulated trade costs and their impact on domestic and international value chains	97
Tariffs, cascading transaction costs, and competitiveness.	98
Cascading transaction costs in the world trade network	106
Conclusions	110

Chapter 5 The middle-income trap and upgrading along global value chains 119

Definitions and implications of the middle-income trap	121
The relevance of global value chain trade for understanding the middle-income trap	126
Conclusions and policy implications	134

Chapter 6 Services trade and global value chains. 141

The role of services in global value chains	142
How services participation in global value chains is measured	143
The emerging patterns of services in global value chains	144
The implications of services in global value chains.	148
Policy implications	153
Conclusions	155

Chapter 7 Institutional quality and participation in global value chains 161

Institutions and participation in global value chains	161
African involvement in global value chains	166
Policy implications	168

Chapter 8 Preferential trade agreements and global value chains: Theory, evidence, and open questions 175

Evolution of preferential trade agreements	176
Global value chains and the rationale for trade agreements.	178
Do deep agreements promote global value chains?.	179
Global value chains and the content of preferential trade agreements	180
Global value chains and the choice of preferential trade agreement partners	181
The future of the relationship between deep agreements and global value chains	182
Conclusions	183

Appendix 1 Authors' conferences. 187

First Authors' Conference: Background Papers	187
Second Authors' Conference: Chapters	189

Annexes

1.1	Typology of global value chains	29
1.2	Governance arrangements along a production sequence	30
2.1	Shifting roles in global value chains for intermediate and final goods.	61
2.2	Key to country abbreviations and sector codes.	66
3.1	Result, variables, and data sources for the study by Kowalski and Lopez-Gonzales (2016)	91
4.1	Extended effective protection rates and the relative price of value added	113
4.2	Measuring the length of global value chains and the number of border crossings	114
5.1	Attempts to quantify the middle-income trap	135
7.1	Results for Dollar, Ge, and Yu (2016) and Miranda and Wagner (2015).	170

Boxes

2.1	Identifying global value chain activities with new indicators	38
2.2	Identifying which types of production are global value chain activities and which are not	41
2.3	The evolution of cross-border production sharing in complex global value chains	51
4.1	Tariff and nontariff measures	103
4.2	Transaction costs, trade, and foreign direct investment	108
5.1	Lessons from China for apparel upgrading	133

Figures

1	Global value chains were expanding, until the financial crisis	2
2	Nominal growth rates of different value-added creation activities, 1996–2014	3
3	The estimated smile curve for China’s exports of electrical and optical equipment deepened between 1995 and 2009	4
4	Efficiency and factor income distribution in the information and communication industry in the United States, 1995–2009	5
5	Efficiency and factor income distribution in the information and communication industry in China, 1995–2009	5
6	Trade in components shows three interrelated production hubs	7
7	Developing countries deeply involved in global value chains have low unit labor costs but not low wages, 2000 and 2010	8
8	Relationship between the Logistics Performance Index and a centrality measure of country involvement in global value chains	9
9	The share of services is higher and has increased more sharply in trade in value added than in trade in gross terms, 1980, 1995, and 2009	10
10	The share of services in exports is higher for developed countries, 2011	10
11	Developing countries maintain high restrictions on services trade	11
1.1	Genealogical map of analytical frameworks for global value chains	16
1.2	Three cascading constraints of globalization	18
1.3	Modes of organizing value chains	19
1.4	Typology of global value chains	20
1.5	Optimal form of outsourcing options	21
1.6	Sequential choices for organizing value chains	23
1.7	Bilateral trade and value-added balances for the United States, by partner, 2004	24
1.8	China’s real effective exchange rates	25
1.9	Gross trade accounting framework	25
1.10	Relative line position of countries in the regional production networks of East Asia, 1985, 2005	27
2.1	Trends in global GDP and manufacturing trade before and after recent economic downturns, 1995–2015	39
2.2	Evolution of intraregional trade in intermediate and final manufactured goods, 1995–2015	40
2.3	Trends in production activities as a share of global GDP, by type of value-added creation activity, 1995–2014	43
2.4	Simple global value chain production activities as a share of total global value chain production activities, 1995–2014	43
2.5	Nominal growth rates of value-added creation activities during the global business cycle at the global level, 1996–2014	44
2.6	Nominal growth rates of value-added creation activities during the global business cycle at the manufacturing and services sector level, by forward and backward linkages, 1996–2014	45
2.7	Structural changes in different types of value-added creation activities at the global level between 2011 and 2015	46
2.8	Structural changes in different types of value-added creation activities at the sectoral level between 2011 and 2015	46
2.9	Structural changes in different type of value-added creation activities between 2011 and 2015 at the country level	47
2.10	Structural changes in different type of value-added creation activities between 2011 and 2015, at the country and sector levels	48
2.11	Change in average annual growth rate by type of value-added creation activity between 2003–08 and 2011–15	49
2.12	Changes in growth of different types of value-added creation activities between country groups with positive and those with negative GDP growth between 2011 and 2015	50
2.13	Trend in production length by different types of value-added creation activities, world average, 2000–14	52
2.14	Change in production length for different types of value-added creation activities at the global level between 2011 and 2015	52
2.15	Change in production length for different types of value-added creation activities at the sector and economy levels between 2011 and 2015	53
2.16	The decline in the number of border crossings drives the declining length of global value chain production at the country level between 2011 and 2015	53
2.17	Estimated smile curve for China’s exports of electrical and optical equipment, 1995	55

2.18	Estimated smile curve for China's exports of electrical and optical equipment, 2009	55
2.19	Estimated smile curve for Germany's automobile exports production, 1995	57
2.20	Estimated smile curve for Germany's automobile exports production, 2009	57
2.21	Labor productivity and income distribution for the United States, 1995–2009	58
2.22	Labor productivity and income distribution for China, 1995–2009	59
A2.1.1	Eastern European economies' trade of intermediate manufactured goods with Europe, 1995–2015	61
A2.1.2	Poland's exports of final and intermediate goods (motor vehicles) to Germany, 2000–15	61
A2.1.3	Bilateral exports of Poland and Czech Republic, by manufacturing technology, 2000 and 2015	62
A2.1.4	Intra-NAFTA trade in intermediate manufactured goods, by main destination and origin, 1995, 2005, and 2015	63
A2.1.5	Mexico's trade with the United States in final and intermediate goods related to motor vehicles, 1995–2015	63
A2.1.6	Evolution of net trade in intermediate and final manufactured goods of Cambodia and Thailand with China, the European Union, and the United States, 2000–15 and 1991–2015	64
A2.1.7	Evolution of net trade in intermediate and final textile products of Cambodia and Viet Nam with China and the world, 2000–15	64
3.1	The smile curve of the global value chain, 1970s and 2000s	70
3.2	Labor productivity: Manufacturing relative to business services in selected Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development countries, 2010	71
3.3	China's exports of textiles, by origin of value added, 1991 and 2011	71
3.4	Significant determinants of a change in domestic value added in exports for developed and emerging economies	73
3.5	Evolution of unit labor costs and average wages, 2000 to 2010	75
3.6	Determinants of change in domestic value added in exports, by sector	76
3.7	Changes in measures of integration into global value chains between 1995 and 2011 for the 63 economies in the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development–World Trade Organization Trade in Value-Added database	76
3.8	Intraregional and extraregional value chains, by region, for the 63 economies in the OECD–WTO Trade in Value-Added database, 1995 and 2011	77
3.9	Extraregional and intraregional trade in intermediates, 2014	78
3.10	Composition of trade in low-income countries by intermediate and final goods, 2000–13	78
3.11	Convergence in income per capita and exports in Africa relative to the United States between 1995 and 2014	79
3.12	Economic complexity rankings in Africa, 1995 and 2014	79
3.13	Economic complexity rankings in Latin America and the Caribbean, 1995 and 2014	79
3.14	Economic complexity rankings in Asia and Central Europe, 1995 and 2014	80
3.15	Correlation of change in economic complexity rankings and change in foreign value-added content of exports between 1995 and 2014	81
3.16	Regional exports by share of technological intensity, 2014	82
3.17	Number of exporters in Latin America and the Caribbean by main export destination, 2011	83
3.18	Selected regional and megaregional agreements, 2016	84
3.19	Gross exports of motor vehicles and parts by region and origin of value added, 2011	84
4.1	Ten countries with the highest and lowest trade cost in all sectors, 2011	105
4.2	The global value chain zoo: spiders, snakes, and hybrid "snikers"	107
4.3	Ad valorem and accumulated trade costs in snakes and spiders	109
4.4	Graphical representation of trade in intermediate goods, 2011	111
4.5	PageRank scores and Logistics Performance Index values, 2011	112
5.1	GDP per capita growth, by income group, 2006–15	120
5.2	Ohno's stages of catch-up industrialization	122
5.3	Product space maps of Peru and the Republic of Korea in 2009	125
5.4	Achieving functional, product, and intersectoral upgrading through skills, capital, and process upgrading	127
5.5	Transmission channels from global value chain participation to the domestic economy	128
5.6	Growth of global value chain integration and GDP per capita by income category	129
5.7	How global value chain determinants evolve as the engagement in global value chain changes	130
6.1	Deconstructing services value added in gross exports	144
6.2	Gross exports of goods and services as a percentage of total world gross exports, 1980, 1995, and 2009	145
6.3	Value-added exports of goods and services as a percentage of total world value-added exports, 1980, 1995, and 2009	145
6.4	Share of direct, indirect, and foreign services value added in world gross exports, 1995–2011	145
6.5	Direct and indirect domestic services value added and foreign services value added in gross exports, by country, 2011	146
6.6	Decomposition of services value added in world gross exports, by manufacturing industry, 2011	147
6.7	Decomposition of jobs embodied in gross manufacturing exports, by business function by industry, 2011	148

6.8	Financial development and revealed comparative advantage, by degree of embodied services, 2005	151
6.9	Direct and indirect value added exports of financial services as shares of GDP, 1995–2009	152
6.10	Direct and indirect value-added exports of business services as shares of GDP, 1995–2009.	152
6.11	Services trade restrictiveness by services sector and region.	154
7.1	Value added in business services as a percentage of GDP in China and the United States, 1985–2005	162
7.2	Relationship of own and neighboring countries’ judicial quality (rule of law)	165
7.3	Average revealed comparative advantage across industries and countries, controlling for local institutional effects.	166
7.4	Depth of integration in global value chains of Sub-Saharan African and comparator countries, 2008–12	166
7.5	Institutional quality relative to development level in African countries: Association of Rule of Law Index and GDP per capita, 2010	167
7.6	Potential increase in trade in Sub-Saharan Africa from improvements in investment climate.	168
8.1	The number and content of preferential trade agreements, 1951–2015	176
8.2	“WTO-plus” policy areas in preferential trade agreements, 2015	177
8.3	“WTO-extra” policy areas in preferential trade agreements, 2015	177
8.4	Relationship between depth of preferential trade agreements and global value chain trade	178
8.5	The impact of deep preferential trade agreements on two types of global value chain trade	179
8.6	The depth of preferential trade agreements by the type or provisions and the development level of members	181

Maps

6.1	Restrictiveness of services trade policy, 2008–10.	153
7.1	Rule of law across Africa	168

Tables

2.1	Contribution to the change in global manufacturing trade by trade type, 1995–2015	39
A2.2.1	Country abbreviations	66
A2.2.2	Sector codes	66
3.1	Average wages and unit labor costs in manufacturing in selected developing and emerging economies, 2000 and 2010	74
3.2	Number of exported products by destination from countries in Latin America and the Caribbean, 2014	83
3.3	Main characteristics of targeted programs to promote the automotive industry in selected countries, 2014	85
3.4	Multi-institution and multidimensional policy mix targeted to the automotive industry, 2014	86
3.5	Policy mix of the National Incentive Scheme, Czech Republic, 2014.	87
3.6	Horizontal programs that can support the automotive sector in Mexico, 2014	88
3.7	Turkey’s investment incentives system, 2014	88
A3.1.1	Determinants of changes in the domestic value added in exports (standardized coefficients).	91
A3.1.2	Description of variables	92
A3.1.3	Descriptive statistics	92
4.1	Amplification effect of trade costs on value added and profit margin.	99
4.2	Magnification effect on tariff costs under global value chain trade, 2004.	100
4.3	Influence of trade cost on value added and profit margin, domestic versus export prices	101
4.4	Incidence of trade costs on output and input prices, 2006–11.	104
5.1	Share of all countries in a given income group in 2000 and 2015	120
5.2	Countries that have escaped the middle-income trap	124
5.3	Trajectories in global value chain engagement	131
5.4	The institutional dimension of global value chain engagement	132
A5.1.1	Country status relative to indicators associated with middle-income trap	135
7.1	Ten most and ten least contract-intensive manufacturing industries	163
A7.1.1	Summary of Dollar, Ge, and Yu (2016) industry results	170
A7.1.2	Summary of Dollar, Ge, and Yu (2016) firm results	171
A7.1.3	Summary of Miranda and Wagner (2015) main	172
8.1	The trust dilemma of deep integration	183

Partners

The World Bank is an international development institution established by the Articles of Agreement adopted by its member countries. The World Bank's overarching mission is to reduce poverty, improve living conditions, and promote sustainable and comprehensive development in its developing member countries. It has two ambitious goals to anchor its mission: end extreme poverty within a generation and boost shared prosperity. It will achieve these goals by providing loans, concessional financing, technical assistance, and knowledge-sharing services to its developing member countries and through partnerships with other organizations.

The Institute of Developing Economies (IDE-JETRO) is a government-affiliated research institute that conducts basic and comprehensive research on economics, politics, and social issues in developing countries. Through its research, IDE-JETRO contributes to knowledge on developing economies and better understanding of the regions to the government and public.

The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) is an international and intergovernmental organization comprising the world's main industrialized market economies

whose mission is to promote policies that will improve the economic and social well-being of people around the world: Better Policies for Better Lives. The OECD does this by providing a forum for governments to share experiences and seek solutions to common problems.

The Research Center of Global Value Chains is a global academic think tank headquartered at the University of International Business and Economics, focusing on basic and interdisciplinary research on the development of global value chains and their implications for global economies.

The World Trade Organization (WTO) is an international organization that deals with the global rules of trade between countries. It administers agreements, negotiated and signed by its members, which provide the legal ground rules for international commerce. The purpose is to help trade flow as freely as possible for the economic development and the welfare of its members' citizens. The WTO is serviced by a secretariat that provides expert, impartial, and independent support to member governments, including research, analysis, and statistical information related to the role and developments of trade in the global economy.

Contributors

David Dollar

Senior Fellow, John L. Thornton China Center, Brookings Institution

Satoshi Inomata

Chief Senior Researcher, Institute of Developing Economies,
Japan External Trade Organization

Christophe Degain

Senior Statistician, World Trade Organization

Bo Meng

Senior Researcher, Institute of Developing Economies, Japan
External Trade Organization

Zhi Wang

Professor and Director, Research Center of Global Value Chains,
University of International Business and Economics

Nadim Ahmad

Head of Trade and Competitiveness Statistics Division, Statistics
Directorate, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and
Development

Annalisa Primi

Head of Structural Policies and Innovation Unit, Development
Centre, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

Hubert Escaith

Former Chief Statistician, World Trade Organization

Jakob Engel

Economist, Trade and Competitiveness, World Bank

Daria Taglioni

Lead Economist, Trade and Competitiveness, World Bank

Cecilia Heuser

Research Analyst, Development Economics Research Group,
World Bank

Aaditya Mattoo

Research Manager, Trade and International Integration, World
Bank

Matthew Kidder

Assistant Professor, University of International Business and
Economics

Michele Ruta

Lead Economist, Trade and Competitiveness, World Bank

Jose Guilherme Reis

Manager, Trade and Competitiveness, World Bank

Abbreviations and acronyms

ADB	Asian Development Bank
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
CEPII	Institute for Research on the International Economy
EU	European Union
FDI	Foreign direct investment
G7	Group of Seven
G20	Group of Twenty
GDP	Gross domestic product
GVC	Global value chain
ICT	Information and communication technology
IDE–JETRO	Institute of Developing Economies–Japan External Trade Organization
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Area
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
UN	United Nations
WTO	World Trade Organization

The importance of the global value chain (GVC) phenomenon has stimulated researchers to develop statistics and analysis based on the value added in trade. The GVC phenomenon also demands that researchers analyze the discrete tasks or phases in the production process. Data are now available on the value added traded among major economies during 1995–2014. This first *Global Value Chain Development Report* draws on the expanding research that uses data on the value added in trade. Its main objective is to reveal the changing nature of international trade that can be seen only by analyzing it in terms of value added and value chains.

ISBN 978-92-870-4125-8



9 789287 041258